

# The Municipal Human Rights Education Plan of São Paulo: the Experience of Participative Formulation of a Normative Paradigm for Human Rights Education for São Paulo\*

Eduardo C. B. Bittar<sup>+</sup>

Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy  
and General Theory of Law, Faculty of Law,  
University of São Paulo, Brazil

Translated by Norman Michael Rodi  
Revised by Edmund Ryden SJ

## Abstract

This article contains a report of the process of drawing up the municipal decree on human rights education of the city of São Paulo. It describes, and reflects on, the participative coordination process for the construction

---

\* Cite this article as Bittar, Eduardo C. B. 2018. “The Municipal Human Rights Education Plan of São Paulo: the Experience of Participative Formulation of a Normative Paradigm for Human Rights Education for São Paulo.” Retrieved from <http://www.taiwanhrj.org/contents/292>

+ Eduardo C. B. Bittar is Associate Professor at the Department of Philosophy and General Theory of Law at the Faculty of Law, University of São Paulo (USP, São Paulo, Brazil). He was the Human Rights Education Coordinator for the Municipal Secretariat of Human Rights and Citizenship – SMDHC (Brazil, 2013–2016), in the city of São Paulo and a member of the National Human Rights Education Committee – SDH-PR (Brazil, 2008–2010). He was also the President of the National Human Rights Association – ANDHEP (Brazil, 2007–2010) and is N-2 Researcher of the National Council of CNPq – Brazil (2017–2020).

of a normative paradigm for human rights education in the municipal public services of the city of São Paulo. This norm was established by Municipal Decree No. 57.503 (2016). The paper also discusses the public policy management of the first Municipal Secretariat of Human Rights and Citizenship in the history of São Paulo.

**Keywords**

Municipal Human Rights Education Plan of the City of São Paulo, human rights education, public policies

**1. Human Rights Education in Brazil**

This article presents a report of the experience of building participatory public policies for the implementation of human rights education in the municipality of São Paulo.<sup>1</sup> São Paulo is an important commercial, cultural, political and social center in Brazil, representing one of the great, developed and industrialized, urban centers of the country but still marked by problems such as poverty, inequality, violence and injustice. It is in this scenario that the approach of this article is inserted, not as a theoretical contribution, but as the narrative of the experience of forming a municipal public policy for human rights education. It should, first of all, be pointed out that the objective that guided the whole process was none other than the one stated in the general objectives of the National Human Rights Education Plan of 2006: “*ênfatizar o papel dos direitos humanos na construção de uma sociedade justa, equitativa e democrática* (to emphasize the role of human rights in the construction of a just, equitable and democratic society)”(Comitê Nacional de Educação em Direitos Humanos, 2006: objetivos gerais, b). And it is important to point out that the formulation of the Municipal Human Rights Education Plan of São Paulo (Municipal Ordinance No. 57.503) (6 Dec. 2016) followed the direction of institutionalizing human rights education and doing it through participatory public policies, including mobilizing important actors

<sup>1</sup> About the theoretical approach, see more in Bittar (2016: 81–102). About the more complete description of the Coordination Process see Bittar (2017).

in the civil service and civil society in São Paulo.

Based on the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (1948), the *Vienna Convention* (1993), and the World Program for Human Rights Education (2005 UN Resolution 59/113B), a National Human Rights Committee was set up in Brazil in 2003. This had the greatest impact on the plans (Viola, 2010: 26). The national plan for human rights education (2006), the Third Human Rights National Program (2009) (Decree No. 7.037/2009) and the National Guidelines for Human Rights Education (Resolution No. 01/2012/CNE-MEC) strengthened the institutional and normative reach of human rights education with significant developmental approval at the federal, state and municipal levels.

In Brazil this is the story of the struggle of the last three decades over human rights since the end of the country’s military dictatorship. For this reason, human rights education has such an important purpose in the current context. Moreover, the country is an important point of reference for the Latin American continent, and human rights education is a central point for the consolidation of a culture of human rights. The *United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training* granted universal recognition of the entitlement to human rights education, as a means of promoting universal respect.<sup>2</sup> This encouraged São Paulo, the largest city in Latin America, to put forward more objective and directed programs, acknowledging Latin American efforts, in Chile, Argentina, Paraguay and Brazil for instance, to overcome authoritative regimes (Magendzo, 2007).

**2. Human Rights Education in São Paulo**

It was the notion of education as a practice of freedom and emancipation of consciousness, coming from the ideas of the Brazilian philosopher and educator, Paulo Freire, which guided the struggle for the beginning of the process of formulation of public policies in human rights education (Freire, 2002a; 2002b; 2002c). But, in practice, in São Paulo, it was only possible to overcome obstacles with the establishment of a specialized task force within the administration: the Human Rights Coordination Office of the

<sup>2</sup> Art. 1., 2.: “Human rights education and training is essential for the promotion of universal respect for, and observance of, all human rights and fundamental freedoms for all, in accordance with the principles of the universality, indivisibility and interdependence of human rights”. United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (Resolution A/66/137/2011).

Municipal Secretariat of Human Rights and Citizenship (art. 242, item II, Municipal Ordinance No. 15.764, 27 May 2013). With this initiative, it was possible to overcome a “culture of isolated initiatives” prevalent in human rights education and launch a “culture of public policies” (Bucci, 2002: 249). These were institutionalized, systematic, ongoing and rooted in the work of a number of authors spread out within the city.

Thus São Paulo was of special significance in the collaboration between the Municipal Secretariat for Human Rights and Citizenship and the Municipal Secretariat for Education for the promulgation, following intense political debates, of Municipal Ordinance No. 16.271 (17 Sept. 2015) that established the Municipal Education Plan which was to steer municipal education for the next ten years (2015-2025). The guidelines contained in art. 2, items VII and X (“These are PME guidelines: (...) VII. Promotion of human rights education; X. Dissemination of principles of equity and dignity towards human beings, and of combat against any form of violence”) focus on human rights education.

It is also important to acknowledge the achievement following legal approval that led to the mandatory inclusion of the theme ‘human rights’ in the elementary school curriculum of the municipal school system, through Bill No. 261/11 proposed by Councilor Jamil Murad and passed as Ordinance No. 16.493 (18 July 2016). Article 1 of the Ordinance reads: “*Fica incluído nas disciplinas de História/Geografia da grade curricular do ensino fundamental das escolas da rede municipal de ensino um tópico específico para debate e compreensão dos Direitos Humanos* (To be included in the subjects of history/geography in the elementary school curriculum of the municipal school system a specific topic promoting discussion and comprehension of human rights.”

With local challenges as a starting point and with the collaboration and participation of various authors and following the general guidelines of the National Human Rights Education Plan, as early as 2015 the first draft of what was to become the Municipal Plan in Human Rights Education was produced. After a first draft, a set of measures was put into action to foster the processes of social participation, collaboration between government and civilians, and the collective construction of the plan to cater to the demands of implementing human rights education within the municipal context.

Actually, the task involved adapting the National Human Rights

Education Plan of 2006 to the municipality and the adjustment of its work guidelines, axes and directives to the demands of municipal public services and to the peculiarities of São Paulo. The entire process of drafting the municipal plan followed strict guidelines and took place in the form of a participative democracy involving the affected communities, fostering citizenship in the process of incorporating differences, values, discussions and meaning into the draft from the point of view of its authors, all mobilized towards themes affecting the city of São Paulo. 28

This activity came to its completion as Municipal Ordinance No. 57.503 (6 Dec. 2016) establishing the final version of the municipal plan, after a long revision process, intended to bring unity and strength as a normative landmark to municipal policies in human rights education, which since 2013 were previously in stages of development and implementation along six organizational axes (basic education, higher education, informal education, human rights education in the civil service, education of professionals of the justice system and urban safety, and education and media). These focused on different areas and pointed towards a process of implementation by the municipal civil service.

Little by little success became real and tangible, making human rights education an institutional element in São Paulo, challenging past thinking and permanently empowering human rights, solidifying article 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights: “Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms” (26.2).

### 3. Municipal Policies for Human Rights Education in São Paulo

The municipal policy for human rights education in São Paulo (2013-2016) involved a more drawn-out, broad and intensive process than the construction of the municipal plan itself. From the beginning, support for the theme came from the understanding that human rights education was deemed a priority on the municipal agenda and in terms of its accountability towards the population, with the inclusion of Goal 63 “*Implementar a Educação em Direitos Humanos na Rede Municipal de Ensino* (To implement human rights education in the municipal education system)” and Goal 39 “*Capacitar 6.000 agentes da Guarda Civil Metropolitana em Direitos Humanos e 2.000 em Mediação de Conflitos* (To train 6,000 metropolitan civil guards (armed

police) in human rights and 2,000 in conflict mediation)", in the Programa de Metas da Prefeitura de São Paulo de 2013 (2013 Program of Goals for the São Paulo City Administration).

Human rights education policy for São Paulo involved a number of taskforces. However, from the beginning, the core work was focused on basic education, bearing in mind the priority of educating citizens in formal schooling, the need of including human rights in school curricula, and the need to train professionals in education.<sup>3</sup> These many fronts, with an understanding of the character of the projects to be developed, consolidated into four main axes of work:

- (a) Education – public policy for education in human rights in formal education, carried out with the Municipal Secretariat for Human Rights and Citizenship and the Municipal Education Secretariat.<sup>4</sup>

3 The same process in the superior education can be seen in Bittar (2014: 375–396).

4 Some results will be highlighted here: 6,265 educators formed in Human Rights Education through a number of strategies, such as, specializations offered by UNIFESP/ UFABC (GDE; EDH – MEC-SECADi); 2 Municipal Seminars (2014, centralized venue with 182 participants; and, 2015, decentralized venue with 1,394 participants), participation in classroom and distance courses, Training in 'Respect is Necessary!' presentations, discussion panels and other activities; - four annual editions of municipal prizes for human rights education in the municipal school system (2013; 2014; 2015; 2016), fostering, stimulating and emphasizing more than 40 prize-winning projects, in the categories: school, teacher, student, student union, and initiatives by educational units on human rights education and human rights, from various territories, relative to a diversity of themes concerning human rights (violence, sustainability, memory and truth, nutrition, childhood racism, childhood, democratic administration, urban mobility, racism, equality, art and culture, diversity, among others), of all the 13 regional education offices in the city; - assurance of inclusion (SME; SMDHC), in the Municipal Plan of Education – PME (Municipal Ordinance # 16.271, September 17<sup>th</sup> 2015), of the action guidelines for the Municipal Secretariat of Education, of two Guidelines for municipal education concerning human rights, relevant in terms of setting the course of education for the next 10 years, such as: "promoting education in human rights," "dissemination of principles of equity, human dignity and the combat of any form of violence;" - guarantee of inclusion (SME; SMDHC), in the Municipal Plan of Education – PME (Municipal Ordinance # 16.271, September 17<sup>th</sup> 2015), documentary guidelines for actions by the Municipal Secretariat of Education, with two directives for municipal human rights education, relevant for setting the course of education for the next 10 years, such as: "promotion of human rights education;" "dissemination of principles of equity, dignity towards the human being, and of combat against any form of violence;" - institutionalization of four Centers for Human Rights Education (SMDHC; SME/ SDH-PR) – CHRE, in Centers for Unified Education (CEUs), acting as dissemination centers of HRE, in the following locations: North Zone (CEU Jardim Paulistano – João Eloi do Nascimento Collection); South Zone (CEU Casa Branca – Dona Lurdes – Maria Cecília de Luna Collection); East Zone (CEU São Rafael – Brayan Yamarico Collection); West Zone (CEU Pera Marmelo – Seu Souza Collection), with its action pillars in the following work axes: democratic administration, territorial articulation, elaboration of didactical/

- (b) Culture – putting public education policies in human rights on the city's cultural agenda, in cooperation with the Municipal Secretariat for Human Rights and Citizenship and the Municipal Secretariat for Culture.<sup>5</sup>
- (c) Public Safety- promoting public policies in human rights education in the training of professional urban security personnel, in coordination with the Municipal Secretariat for Human Rights and Citizenship and the Municipal Secretariat for Urban Safety, through the Municipal Civil Guard Training Center.<sup>6</sup>
- (d) Civil Servants: public policy for education in human rights in the civil service, carried out with the Municipal Secretariat of Public Management.<sup>7</sup>

pedagogical materials, training of professionals in the area of education, and, finally, thematic collections for education in human rights in CEU libraries (including more than 5,400 books and materials on human rights). Semifinalist, among 346 registered projects, from 16 countries, in the Contest "Human Rights in Latin America: driving transformation!" organized and sponsored by Ashoka Changemakers.

5 Some results will be highlighted here: coordination and venue for four short-film festivals on human rights – among all (SMDHC; SME; SMC; SPCINE), with annual themes (2013 Transformations, 2014 Cultural Citizenship, 2015 Educating City, 2016 Refugees), presented in audiovisual and human rights training that reached 2,062 people and an estimated total of 32,000 in all exhibitions, exhibited in cultural and educational centers located in different parts of the city of São Paulo, especially in the outskirts (2013, 45 venues; 2014, 57 venues; 2015, 76 venues; 2016, 20 venues), with 22 awards delivered to Film Directors and Cultural Producers; the creation of the "Dom Paulo Evaristo Arns Prize in Human Rights" through Decree # 55.759/2014 and Ordinance # 037/SMDHC/2015, as a homage by the municipality of São Paulo to people or businesses that are clearly involved in the struggle to defend and promote Human Rights, presented, on a regular basis, at public events on the International Day of Human Rights (December 10<sup>th</sup>), with three public figures having been recognized, respecting gender alternation as a factor in the historical fight for human rights in the city of São Paulo: Carlos Alberto Libânio Christo OP (Frei Betto), Luiza Erundina & Fr Jaime Crowe).

6 Some results will be highlighted here: 6,420 Civil Police officers trained in human rights and 4,547 agents trained in conflict mediation participated in training cycles (13 human rights themes) at the Urban Metropolitan Safety Training Center of the Municipal Civil Guard (SMSU; SMDHC); activities directed to the Municipal Civil Guard Training Center to foster human rights within their institutional culture, through various strategies, such as: signing partnerships with ENAM/MJ, SMSU and SMDHC for training in conflict mediation, curriculum restructuring for the Urban Security Training Center (doubled the number of hours in the EQP, from four to eight hours), new academic discipline proposals for the continuing education curriculum of the courses provided by the Urban Security Training Center, modification of the hiring tender for 2,000 new police agents, actions at the Academic Council of the Urban Security Training Center, Distribution of thematic kits, elaboration of pedagogical content and the strengthening of the collection of the Urban Security Training Center, thematic training venues.

7 Some results will be highlighted here: induction for the creation of a course for the training of municipal public servants, prompted by the need to train public administrators for the Municipal Secretariat of

The municipal policy for human rights education did not start from scratch since its roots had already been established in the Municipal Commission for Human Rights, and in previous experiences in the educational system for human rights, in addition to the recognition of important protagonists and the actions of different civil organizations and NGOs in São Paulo. However, the difficulties, resistance and barriers were not to be overlooked, and the process of implementation had to adjust to reality and not the other way around. Nevertheless, after the first negotiations in 2013, the municipal policy began to show results, especially since 2014, intensifying as of 2015 and consolidating in 2016.

Finally, to emphasize a last point in this general balance of public policies in human rights education, the municipal plan (Ordinance No. 57.503, 6 Dec. 2016) was launched during Human Rights Week, 3-10 December 2016, during the Fourth Human Rights Festival of São Paulo.<sup>8</sup> This plan provided a structure and guaranteed the continuity of the work that was undertaken, executed and implemented by generating cutting-edge experiences in São Paulo in the areas of education, culture, urban security, and public services, in addition to symbolically validating, in the form of a normative municipal measure, the entire legacy of four years of hard work,

#### 4. Participative Formation of the Municipal Plan in São Paulo

In line with the view of Nancy Flowers, that “involvement of the community is clearly at the heart of the *experience*”, the process of

---

Human Rights and Citizenship itself, in collaboration with the Municipal School of Administration of São Paulo – EMASP/ Municipal Administration Secretariat – SMG, carried out by the students of government with innovative teaching methods (presentations, thematic discussion boards, real-life experience, film debates, speeches, conferences, interviews of civil servants), having trained 190 servants in human rights in 18 Municipal Secretariats, offering a structured curriculum, methodology and educators for the elaboration of permanent courses for civil servants in human rights themes ( “Fundamental Training in Human Rights and Citizenship” – 24 classroom hours, “Training in Human Rights EAD” 90 hours – EMASP, 2016)

<sup>8</sup> The result is presented here: participative production (involving numerous actors in various stages over the period of one year of consulting work), and systematizing the final text for the Municipal Human Rights Education Plan – PMEDH, based on the original text of the National Human Rights Education Plan – PNEDH, established through Municipal Ordinance no. 57.503, Dec. 6<sup>th</sup> 2016, to unify and strengthen municipal human rights education policies through a municipal normative landmark, through 6 organizational axes: basic education, higher education, non-formal education, human rights education in the civil service, education of professionals of the justice system and urban safety, education and media).

participative construction of the municipal plan was developed by the Human Rights Education Coordination of the Municipal Human Rights Secretariat of the City of São Paulo during the period 2015-2016, resulting in a process with numerous stages and various actors, that took one year for its entire development (Flowers and Shiman, 2007). To meet the need to develop a municipal plan for human rights education, the Secretariat, through its Human Rights Education Coordination, established a network with different actors (public services and civil society) and a number of institutions (public and private institutions), both governmental and non-governmental, to foster a culture of human rights and human rights education in São Paulo.

It was understood that there are no human rights without democratic and participative practices, as stated in Article 7 of the United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training.<sup>9</sup> However, for this process to come to fruition, it was very important to consider the following stages:

- (a) institutionalization of education in human rights;
- (b) establishment of communication networks;
- (c) crystallization of practices, actors, instances and collective groups;
- (d) implementation of public policies;
- (e) assessment of effective results;
- (f) permanent articulation with actors and instances;
- (g) dialogue for the processing of participation;
- (h) accountability of the results of the public policies.

Thus, the different strategies of social participation were developed to guarantee the involvement of agents in the participative process: (a) submission of the draft for approval by the Secretariat, (b) public consultation through the site São Paulo Aberta (Open São Paulo) between 10 and 31 March 2016, (c) promotion of seminars and gathering of proposals and suggestions, (d) consultation with municipal secretariats involved with the theme, (e) consultation with entities and groups with a track record in human rights,

---

<sup>9</sup> “States, and where applicable relevant governmental authorities, have the primary responsibility to promote and ensure human rights education and training, developed and implemented in a spirit of participation, inclusion and responsibility.” United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training 7.1 (Resolution A/66/137/2011).

(f) presentation of texts to members of the Interdepartmental Taskforce in Human Rights Education at the Secretariat, (g) submission of the draft for approval and local discussion, in the context of the four Centers for Human Rights Education of the Municipal Education System, and internal seminars organized by the Intersecretarial Working Group for Education in Human Rights and by Nuclei for Education in Human Rights, always seeking to foster discussions and technical progress of the proposed text. Only after receiving countless suggestions, contributions and revisions, was the text consolidated and systematized, reaching its final draft for its definitive integration into the municipal judicial order.

All of these phases were decisive to ensuring the quality of the final document. This shows that democracy is not simply a matter of government. Rather democracy has to be transformed, above all, through shared experience, considering bonds of trust relating to common social and educational challenges. Here the quality of human relationships and the quality of social interaction is emphasized. This dimension of the common policy-making process was perceived directly from concrete experience.

Even if the ethical community was not fully established prior to the debate and implementation process of the municipal policy, it was in training, gathering elements, expanding and gaining in strength over time, that, at the end of the process, it gathered the necessary links to mobilize, articulate and participate in the different open venues which led to the drawing-up of the final document. In these daily activities of construction and of coexistence with the other, mobilization of the other was a deciding factor in the process of joint construction of the plan. Thanks to the mediation of working together at daily tasks and the stress on association, collective dynamics and complementary roles, bonds within the community were forged with a view towards the public interest and social justice (Sobottka, 2009: 158).

The democratic process is inextricable from the meaning of what human rights are. The objectives of human rights education, based on the concept of democracy in the communitarian perspective of Robert D. Putnam, emphasize the idea of a 'civic community' (Benevides, 2009: 323). This is crucial if citizens are to become active and interested in what is done in common. It teaches them how to weigh the relation between their private interests and what is of public interest (Putnam, 2006: 101). It is certain that civic activism instigated by the government's need to engage a number of

areas (formal education, informal education, the third sector, municipal civil servants) and to activate the process of citizen activism was a determining factor for the quality in processing the document and was integrated into the process that culminated in greater achievements and benefits for the entire City (Putnam, 2006: 103). However, pre-existing support from civil entities, in addition to activist civil servants and mobilized citizens in the territory of the City was a contributory factor.

On the different fronts in which human rights education was developing, bonds between citizens were consolidated, strengthening the involvement of partners, who became active participants at the different stages of work, in specific shared tasks. Therefore, there was a great emphasis on utilizing a democratic method which, in itself, generates learning within the participative process. Participative democracy, as developed by Jürgen Habermas, is not merely seen in the 'results', understood as 'final products' of actions, projects or public policies.

Thus, in order for the plan to slowly gain in objectivity and to signify a normative matrix for São Paulo, bonds of reciprocity had to be instigated and developed around the theme, without great commotion or time barriers. However, the bonds of reciprocity that were established around the human rights education agenda were sufficiently capable of projecting social capital as a determining factor for the quality of municipal public policy. This was done within the common grounds of confidence and cooperation, in the shared challenge of filling a normative gap in São Paulo by facing the enormous task collectively (Putnam, 2006: 160). This is, too, how the citizens and civil servants participating in the process became, in the sense given by Rainer Forst, legal citizens who are instruments of rights and, in this sense, protagonists of rights and justice (Forst, 2010: 313). So it is clear that a significant part of this concrete experience points to the fact that participatory democracy is effective in combating violence, in building awareness and in determining positive results for the construction of human rights and human rights education.

## 5. The Main Axes of the Municipal Human Rights Education Plan for the City of São Paulo

Municipal Ordinance No. 57.503 (6 December 2016) instituting the Municipal Human Rights Education Plan is structured along 6 axes, with

the Human Rights Education Coordination by the Municipal Secretariat of Human Rights and Citizenship along with the Municipal Committee of Human Rights Education responsible for its monitoring and implementation (Article 2). An Annex to the Ordinance lists the presentation, introduction, methodology, general objectives and general lines of action and sets out six axes (Axis I basic education, Axis II higher education, Axis III informal education, Axis IV human rights education in the civil service, Axis V education of professionals of the justice system and urban safety, and Axis VI education and media).

The broad objectives of the plan encompass the following eleven tasks:

- a) consolidating the role of human rights in the construction of a free, just, diverse, and democratic society bound together in solidarity;
- b) emphasizing the strategic role of organization and planning of human rights education and the strengthening of a social and democratic state of law;
- c) contributing to the realization of national and local commitments, considering territories and their special needs, with human rights education inserted into formative processes practiced in family life, in human contacts, at work, in educational and research facilities, in social movements and civil organizations and in cultural expressions;
- d) promoting national and international cooperation in the implementation of human rights education;
- e) proposing transversality of education and human rights in public policies, mobilizing institutional and inter-institutional development in a wide range of sectors (education, health, communication, culture, security and urban mobility, sports and leisure, among others);
- f) orientating municipal educational policy planning, towards the consolidation of a culture of respect for human rights;
- g) establishing objectives, guidelines and courses of action for the elaboration of programs and projects in the area of human rights education;
- h) proposing and stimulating reflection, studies and research on human rights education, prioritizing themes related to civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights, respect for the elderly, children

and youth, cross-generational relationships, awareness in terms of consumption, memory and truth, migrants, homelessness, gender, race and ethnicity, religion, traditional populations, sexual orientation, disabled and gifted people, among others;

- i) stimulating the establishment and strengthening of municipal public forums, nuclei, spaces, institutions and policies with the perspective of human rights education;
- j) defining strategies and mechanisms to assess and monitor programs, projects and actions of the plan;
- k) supporting the Centers for Human Rights Education—South Zone: Casa Branca, North Zone: Jardim Paulistano, East Zone: São Rafael, West Zone: Pera Marmelo—as reference facilities in human rights education for the different axes contemplated by the plan. For these goals to become possible and concrete, the plan states that they will be implemented through seven courses of action: (1) normative and institutional development, (2) production of information and knowledge, (3) holding events, (4) production and distribution of materials, (5) training and capacity-building of professionals, (6) administration of programs and projects, (7) implementation of monitoring, assessment and updating mechanisms and equipment for the plan.

Based on these tasks, it is possible to see that if the participatory construction process of the plan was filled with obstacles and difficulties, the process of implementing it also presents enormous challenges.

In their structure and textual presentation, all six axes of the plan are written in such a way as to possess guiding principles and programmed actions, to be presented one axis at a time, if so desired.

## I Basic Education

The axis of basic education includes 26 programmed actions which continue the training process. They include preparing teaching materials and developing institutional and participative mechanisms to foster formal education in human rights. This involves about 80,000 active professional educators and about 1,451 schools operating in the municipal education system. Programmed actions are focused on curricula, on

the political-pedagogical project, on the training of professionals and educators, on institutional dialogue, on the autonomy of educators and students and on the development of actions, projects and programming.

## II Higher Education

The higher education axis has ten programmatic actions, taking into account the enormous number of universities, both state or federal and private, in São Paulo, and the potential that higher education has to contribute through teaching, research and extension programs. The municipality, however, is not legally responsible for the institutional development of state or federal universities in Brazil. The course of action seeks to encourage project integration, networking, mapping of initiatives, promotion of conferences, and the development of training.

## III The Informal Axis

The informal axis involves fifteen programmatic measures, focused on strengthening the autonomy of civilian, social and non-governmental initiatives in the dissemination of a popular education in human rights, with the mapping out of networks and the establishment of dialogue between protagonists.

## IV Human Rights Education in the Civil Service

The axis of human rights education in the civil service has four programmatic actions and is centrally supported by the Municipal School of Administration of São Paulo, which comprises 167,331 municipal civil servants (in health, housing, sports and leisure, environment, transportation, education, culture, urban security, cleaning, construction, and administration). The goal is to ensure that training of municipal civil servants will be implemented in accordance with respect for human rights.

## V Education of Justice and Urban Security Officials

The axis of education of justice and urban security professionals has two axes directed to professionals in the judicial area, namely municipal prosecutors. Here the focus is on training and dissemination by means of CEJUR courses, and 25 axes for urban security professionals, focused

on the Municipal Civil Guard Training Center for the continued training of 6,000 municipal civil guards (armed police), considering the role of municipal civil guards in the protection of citizens' rights, acting in accordance with urban security for citizens, with constant professional recycling and new curricula specific for practical application in urban security affairs.

## VI Education and Media

The education and media axis has 19 programmatic actions and goals in order to promote a broader commitment from communication channels regarding their dissemination of human rights in the mainstream media. It uses the promotion of campaigns, activities, projects and mechanisms for the dissemination of a human rights culture.

## 6. Municipal Public Policy and the Emancipation of Citizen Consciousness in the City of São Paulo

The structuring of municipal public policy in human rights education was a challenging task and beset by many difficulties, including those linked to the reality of the civil service in Brazil. However, the initial projections were gradually consolidated as successful policies with the first signs appearing in 2014 and 2015. Acceptance of the projects came through democratic dialogue, professional commitment, collective work and the need for a public agenda, but the route to success was complex because it was subject to different paradigms and the professional dynamics of government offices and institutions. It is known, however, that the participating actors remained mobilized and motivated by the democratic dynamics of municipal public policy in human rights education, which in itself was transformative. This means that the process of implementation of the plan at the next stage is, in itself, a challenge for another decade of work.

Furthermore, the projects were developed with communities, actors and citizens in venues spread far apart. São Paulo has many diverse and widely separated areas, marked by antagonism, struggles for rights and challenges. The specific issues of each area were, not only respected, but instrumental in the design of municipal policies and in the redefinition of identities within

human rights education practices.<sup>10</sup> The conclusion can only be that, in order for the plan to be possible, São Paulo with all its territories had to enrich the document with the contribution of real people, so that it could become an important legal reference for the city. This social capital remained active in contributing to the process of formation of the document and has made an important difference in its content.

## 7. Conclusions

<sup>37</sup> The municipal policies for human rights education in São Paulo took root and were consolidated over the period 2013-2016. This is a concrete experience that can be shared with other cities and with other countries in a very fruitful way. In addition, we can consider that the plan for human rights education has become a landmark in the history of the municipality, not only for being the first but, above all, because it is a document that adds value to pre-existing projects and initiatives, strengthening initiatives, processes and actions. In comparative terms, the starting point of the plan of 2016 was the national plan of 2006, but the municipal plan is a more modern, complete, complex and specific legal document to meet the local needs of human rights education in São Paulo.

Today, the municipal plan is connected to the great values that guide the legal documents that are a point of reference for rights in the world. It offers important normative guidelines for educators and civil servants through its six axes which structure public policies and continuously and definitively establish human rights education in São Paulo.

Paulo Freire's ideas of education, and Jürgen Habermas's views of democracy have proved to be current and useful tools for the process of constructing public policy in human rights education. These ideas are connected to each other. Moreover, it can be affirmed that the concrete experience extracted from the process of building public policies strengthens the idea shared with other authors that there is a close connection between law, democracy, morality and the construction of peace based on human

<sup>10</sup> Thus, the *democratic, participative* design, focused on a *mutual learning relationship*, enabled the consolidation of projects, while spaces and relationships solidified, allowing for a number of proposals made over this period to reach their marks within the city goals – Goal 63 (set at 100% and accomplished 100%); and, in some cases, results exceeded city goals – Goal 39 (set at 100% and reached 167.2% (Prefeitura de São Paulo, <http://planejasampa.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/metals/>, Accessed 26 July 2017).

rights.<sup>11</sup> On the one hand, it is certain that the absence of such a law is an excuse for non-compliance with human rights, but, on the other hand, it is also certain that—as much analysis and research concludes—the mere presence of a law does not mean the necessary fulfillment of its objectives (Dubois, 2007: 466–467). Enforcement will always be a particular challenge.

But, if democracy is a challenge today in Brazil given the current crisis at the federal level (2013-2017), this legal document helps to guide the look in the correct sense, because the municipal plan is an historic landmark and symbolic step since it is synonymous with the systematization, orientation, reference, security, institutionality and legality of a theme normally excluded from public debate. The plan confers democratic legitimacy and legality to the discourse, practices, initiatives and projects for human rights in São Paulo.

The results of this concrete experience allow us to affirm that juridical enforcement of human rights education is not sufficient in itself. However, it is an important step in addressing today's neo-conservatism. This article registers an important concrete experience that can be universalized, from the relation between democracy and human rights, through dialogue, considering the contents, contexts and local challenges. Thus, while the structure of the municipal plan can be replicated, practices must be concerned with the local challenges of each culture, population and city. The city of São Paulo can be considered as a global point of reference that houses a structural proposal for the construction of projects and the planning of human rights education. <sup>38</sup>

Despite its significance, we should be aware that, due to the size of São Paulo, its population and its problems, such as violence, poverty and inequality, the creation of the Municipal Secretariat of Human Rights and Citizenship, though a very positive sign, will require concerted efforts, considerable support and committed future investment. It may not just be left to chance in the medium or long term. The particular situation of São Paulo points to enormous difficulties in practicing democracy, considering the distances and diversity of the territories that compose the city.

The process of implementing the municipal plan is a challenge for the future. The plan seeks to ensure that public policies in human rights education

<sup>11</sup> “There is growing evidence of the connection between the legal and social recognition of human rights and peace and prosperity” (Bix, 2017: 43).

are understood as state policies, and not as government policies, considering the protagonism of actors involved and the republicanism in public action. The real connection made with people around this decree is a sign of hope that human rights education will be stronger in São Paulo in the future. The municipal plan has a long life ahead, following Article 3 of the United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training, “human rights education and training is a lifelong process that concerns all ages”, where the continuing character of this form of education. We know that new challenges lie ahead and that the road is as long as life is short.

### 39 References

- Benevides, Maria Victoria de Mesquita. 2009. *Fé na Luta*. São Paulo, SP: Editora Lettera Doc.
- Bittar, Eduardo C. B. 2014. “A Experiência da Associação Nacional de Pesquisa e Ensino em Direitos Humanos – ANDHEP: Gestão, Execução e Representação.” In *A Formação em Direitos Humanos Na Educação Superior No Brasil: Trajetórias, Desafios e Perspectivas*, eds. Giuseppe Tosi et al. 375–396. João Pessoa: CCTA.
- . 2016. *Democracy, Justice and Human Rights: Studies of Critical Theory and Social Philosophy of Law*. LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing.
- . 2017. “Educación en Derechos Humanos Como Política Pública: La Experiencia de la Coordinación de Educación en Derechos Humanos de la Secretaría Municipal de Derechos Humanos y Ciudadanía de la Ciudad de São Paulo.” *Anuario de Derechos Humanos* 13: 97–109.
- Bix, Brian. 2017. “Human Rights, Peace and the Relationship of Moral and Legal Rights.” Paper presented at the XXVIII World Congress on Philosophy of Law and Social Philosophy, Lisbon. July 17.
- Bucci, Maria Paula Dallari. 2002. *Direito Administrativo e Políticas Públicas*. Brazil: Saraiva Editora.
- Comitê Nacional de Educação em Direitos Humanos. 2006. *Plano Nacional de Educação em Direitos Humanos*. Brasília : Secretaria Especial dos Direitos Humanos; Ministério da Educação.
- Dubois, Marc. 2007. “Educação em Direitos Humanos para a Polícia.” In *Educação em Direitos Humanos para o século XXI*, eds., Richard P. Claude and George Andreopoulos. 455–484. São Paulo: EDUSP.
- Flowers, Nancy and David A. Shiman. 2007. “Educação de Professores e a Visão de Direitos Humanos.” In *Educação em Direitos Humanos para o século XXI*, eds. Richard P. Claude and George Andreopoulos, trans. Ana Luiza Pinheiro. 253–273. São Paulo: EDUSP.
- Forst, Rainer. 2010. *Contextos da Justiça*. Boitempo.
- Freire, Paulo. 2002a. *Educação como prática da liberdade*, 26th.
- . 2002b. *Pedagogia da autonomia*, 25th ed.
- . 2002c. *Pedagogia da esperança*, 9th ed.
- Magendzo, Abraham K. 2007. “Os problemas de planejamento na educação em direitos humanos nas democracias latino-americanas em processo de restauração,” In *Educação em Direitos Humanos para o Século XXI*, eds. Richard P. Claude and George Andreopoulos. 667–686. São Paulo: Núcleo de Estudos da Violência.
- Sobottka, Emil A. 2009. “Participação e Democracia.” In *Justiça Global e Democracia: Homenagem a John Rawls*, eds. Nythamar de Oliveira and Draiton Gonzaga de Souza. EdIPUCRS.
- Putnam, Robert. 2006. *Comunidade e Democracia: A Experiência da Itália Contemporânea*. FGV.
- Viola, S. E. 2010. “Políticas de Educação em Direitos Humanos.” In *Políticas e Fundamentos da Educação em Direitos Humanos*, eds. Aida Maria Monteiro Silva and Celma Tavares. Cortez Editora.

# 巴西聖保羅市的人權教育計畫： 以參與式途徑建構人權教育規範性 典範的經驗

Eduardo C. B. Bittar

巴西聖保羅大學法學院哲學與法理學系副教授

## 摘要

本文的主旨，在於為巴西聖保羅市政府建構人權教育計畫的經驗提出報告，全文描述及反思以下兩個主題：一、聖保羅市採取的參與式協調程序，此一程序為該市的公共服務政策建立規範性的人權教育典範；二、該市史上首次設立的「市立人權與公民事務秘書處」，本文將說明這個機構在政策管理上運作的情形。

## 關鍵字

聖保羅市人權教育計畫、人權教育、公共政策

---